

ANGUS COUNCIL

INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES COMMITTEE - 21 APRIL 2009

SUBJECT: PUBLIC TRANSPORT UPDATE

REPORT BY DIRECTOR OF INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES

Abstract: This report informs Members of proposed changes to local bus services in Angus and seeks approval for the award of contracts to continue local bus service provision in the Liff/Fowlis and Glen Clova areas following the withdrawal of services.

1 RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Committee –

1. agree to the award of a Best Value contract to Travel Dundee for the provision of services to Liff and Fowlis on Mondays to Fridays from 05:45 until 15:30 as detailed in this report;
2. agree to the award of contracts as detailed in [Appendix 3, 3A](#) to this report in order to maintain service provision to Liff and Fowlis;
3. agree to the award of Contract EMY 270 and Best Value contract A272 for the extension of Service 801 to operate on non-schooldays in order to maintain local bus service provision in the Glen Clova area; and
4. note the proposed local bus service revisions in the Angus area detailed in this report.

2 INTRODUCTION

- 2.1 Members at the last meeting of this committee were informed that Dundee City Council had withdrawn funding for the Dundee – Liff/Fowlis service from the end of April and agreed that tenders be sought on a short-term emergency basis to provide replacement facilities for Angus residents (Report 197/09 refers). The timescale for the withdrawal of this service has changed and the current service will not now be withdrawn until 10 May 2009. In view of this extended timescale it has been possible to bring the decision regarding the award of a short-term emergency contract back to this Committee for approval.
- 2.2 Members at the last meeting of this committee were informed that the Royal Mail Post Bus Service to Glen Clova was to be withdrawn from 4 April 2009 (Report 197/09 refers). This timescale has changed and the service will now not be withdrawn until 30 April 2009. In view of this extended timescale it has been possible to bring the decision regarding the award of any short-term emergency contract to provide a replacement facility back to this Committee for approval.
- 2.3 Members are also informed of commercial service changes by Royal Mail Post Bus and Scottish CityLink within Angus.

3 DUNDEE – LIFF / FOWLIS

- 3.1 Extensive on-bus surveys were conducted on the Dundee – Liff / Fowlis service to determine current usage and identify what replacement facilities were required following the withdrawal of funding for the current service by Dundee City Council. Surveys identified that the largest proportion of people using this service were either Dundee City Council residents within the former Liff Hospital grounds; staff, visitors and patients at the six remaining wards at Liff Hospital; or individuals travelling to/from Gourdie Industrial Estate. In light of the survey results this data was shared with Dundee City Council and they were asked if they wished to reconsider their previous decision and enter into a joint cross-boundary arrangement with Angus Council to meet the needs of all bus users. They responded stating that the withdrawal of the service had been a budget saving and as they did not anticipate any additional monies to be forthcoming, Angus Council should not include any funding from Dundee City Council in the replacement plans. The NHS were also contacted regarding the survey results and informed of Angus Council's replacement proposals.
- 3.2 Council officers discussed the survey results with commercial operators providing services in the Liff/Fowlis area to establish whether or not they would consider operating some or all of the service on a commercial basis from 10 May 2009. Travel Dundee having considered their previous operation of the service decided to operate on a commercial basis a new Monday to Friday service from Dundee South Road (Tesco's) to/from Birkhill with connections at Dundee South Road to Dundee City Centre and Ninewells Hospital/Technology Park. This service will operate from approximately 05:45 until 15:30 on Mondays to Fridays. Negotiations with Travel Dundee concluded that Liff Village and Fowlis could be served on a Best Value Basis (See Appendix 1 for details) for a contribution of £10,000 per annum. This service will therefore operate Dundee (South Road, Tesco's) via Liff Hospital, Liff Village, Fowlis, Muirhead, Birkhill to Dundee (South Road, Tesco's). No operator was however willing to provide any commercial element on the service after 15:30 Mondays to Fridays or on Saturdays or Sundays, accordingly, tenders were sought to meet the needs of Angus residents for these periods. In order to keep contract costs to a minimum, tenders for the contracted services were sought to only operate to/from Dundee South Road via Birkhill, Muirhead, Liff and Fowlis i.e. Liff Hospital and the housing within the hospital grounds would not be served.
- 3.3 The tenders sought for the provision of services to Liff/Fowlis were as follows:
- EMY261 – for an approximately 2 hourly service on Saturdays between Fowlis/Liff and Dundee
 - EMY262 – for 3 journeys on Saturdays between Fowlis/Liff and Dundee. Other journeys would be provided through utilising a current contract vehicle in the Auchterhouse area. (Either EMY 261 or EMY 262 would be awarded).
 - EMY263 – for a Sunday service
 - EMY264 – for a Monday to Friday service after 15:30 to cover evening peak journeys

Copies of these tenders are available in the Members' Lounge.

- 3.4 Tenders were sought on an emergency basis with quotes sought from three local bus service operators. The bids received are detailed in Appendix 3 to this report.

- 3.5 On Saturdays two options were sought, one for all the Saturday journeys to be operated, the other for only three journeys with the remaining being provided by utilising the existing Downfield – Auchterhouse contract to serve Liff and Fowlis during periods when the vehicle is currently not operational. Overall the lowest tender price was from Travel Dundee (for EMY 261) who tendered to operate a half-hourly timetable to the same route as the Monday to Friday daytime services as opposed to the 2-hourly timetable proposed. It is recommended that Contract EMY 261 is awarded to Travel Dundee.
- 3.6 On Sundays tenders were sought for two return journeys. The lowest bid received was from Stagecoach Strathtay and it is recommended that this contract is awarded to that company.
- 3.7 On Mondays to Fridays to provide a service after 15:30 the lowest bid received was from Travel Dundee who would operate to the same route as the Monday to Friday daytime services. It is recommended that the contract be awarded to that company.
- 3.8 Alternative combined bids were received from both Stagecoach Strathtay and J P Minicoaches for the provision of services to Liff and Fowlis. These, however do not represent the lowest overall cost to the Council as opposed to the award of the individual contracts as detailed in Appendix 3 to this report together with the Best Value Monday to Friday contract A271 detailed in paragraph 3.2 above.

4 ROYAL MAIL POST BUS SERVICE: KIRRIEMUIR – GLEN CLOVA

- 4.1 Following the announcement by Royal Mail Post Bus that they were to cease operating the Kirriemuir to Glen Clova service (Report 197/09 refers), surveys were undertaken to establish current usage of the service. The usage was found to be low with only approximately 14 passengers per week, on that basis a number of tender options were sought for a bus, DRT or taxi replacement service, these were as follows:

- EMY 265 - a bus replacement service on Mondays to Saturdays mornings
- EMY 266 - a bus replacement facility on Monday to Saturday mornings together with an afternoon non-school days return (a schooldays journey being provided by a registered school transport service)
- EMY267 - a demand responsive transport service (DRT) operating on Monday to Saturday mornings
- EMY 268 – a demand responsive transport service (DRT) operating on Monday to Saturday mornings together with an afternoon non-school days return (a schooldays journey being provided by a registered school transport service)
- EMY 269 - a taxi service operating on Monday to Saturday mornings together with an afternoon non-school days return (a schooldays journey being provided by a registered school transport service)
- EMY 270 - a taxi service operating on Monday to Saturday mornings.

Copies of these tenders are available in the Members' Lounge. Where a morning only journey was tendered the option was to use the school bus for a return journey in the afternoons and award a Best Value extension to the school service to operate on non-school days. The results of this tendering exercise are shown in Appendix 3 to this report.

- 4.2 Tenders were sought from 56 operators, 5 of whom submitted bids. The lowest overall bid received was from Sky Cabs Direct together with awarding a Best Value contract for the provision of non-school days journeys.

5 ROYAL MAIL POST BUS SERVICE: BLAIRGOWRIE – ALYTH – GLEN ISLA

- 5.1 In addition to the withdrawal of the Kirriemuir to Glen Clova Post Bus service, Royal Mail Post Bus have also submitted a de-registration to the Traffic Commissioner withdrawing their commercial Glen Isla service from 24 April 2009. Information on usage from Royal Mail Post Bus confirms that for the period 1 January to 7 March 2009 no passengers were conveyed, in previous years only 2 to 3 passengers per annum have used this service. No action is therefore being taken to provide any replacement facility.

6 SCOTTISH CITYLINK: MONTROSE – DUNDEE

- 6.1 Scottish Citylink is introducing new Service, M92 journeys at 07:50 from Montrose to Dundee and 19:25 from Dundee to Montrose on Mondays to Saturdays. These new journeys are being introduced on a trial basis to meet customer requests and enable Montrose residents to undertake a day trip on Scottish Citylink services.

7 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 7.1 The cost of awarding the contracts as detailed in this report in 2009/10 amounts to £51,088.84 and can be accommodated within the Planning and Transport Revenue Budget for 2009/10. However, in 2010/11 the cost will be £56,798.76 and this together with the additional costs for full year operation of the contracts awarded at the March meeting of this Committee (Report 196/09 refers) bring the local bus service expenditure in a full year to £1,636,045 excluding inflation.
- 7.2 Members will recall that additional one-off funding of £288,000 was approved for 2009/10 bringing the total local bus service budget to £1,580,642. A full review of local bus service provision in Angus is currently being taken forward so that service provision in future years is at a level that is sustainable and affordable. The emergency contracts recommended for award in this report will along with all other local bus service provision in Angus be considered as part of that review.

8 SINGLE OUTCOME AGREEMENT

- 8.1 This report contributes to the following local outcome contained within the Single Outcome Agreement for Angus:
- Our public services are high quality, continually improving, efficient and responsive to local people's needs.

9 CONSULTATION

- 9.1 The Chief Executive, Director of Corporate Services, Head of Finance and Head of Law & Administration have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

10 HUMAN RIGHTS IMPLICATIONS

- 10.1 There are no human rights implications arising from this report.

11 EQUALITIES IMPLICATIONS

- 11.1 The issues dealt with in this Report have been the subject of consideration from an equalities perspective (as required by legislation). An equalities impact assessment is not required.

12 CONCLUSION

- 12.1 The local bus service network continues to be kept closely under review. Where essential journeys are no longer provided then subject to budget availability contracted provision is secured.

ERIC S LOWSON
DIRECTOR OF INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES

NOTE

No background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above Report.

P&T/LEM/IAL
13 April 2009

APPENDIX 1

1	<p>Contract: A271 Route : Dundee (South Road) – Birkhill via Liff Village and Fowlis</p>
2	<p>Current commercial service provision on corridor National Express Dundee (from 11 May 2009) Mon – Fri (05:45 until 15:30)</p>
3	<p>Reason for recommended award of ‘best value’ contract The award of a contract under ‘best value’ provisions meets the following criteria set out in Appendix 11(a) of Angus Council’s Financial Regulations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To divert an existing service to serve a settlement / area – the alternative being to provide a separate contract in order to provide the facility. <p>The award of this contract is considered to represent the best value to the Council and avoids any competition with the commercial service provision.</p> <p>The service level which will be provided of 2 buses an hour is far in excess of any provision which would sought under a separate contract let by Angus Council – this ‘Best Value’ contract therefore delivers the best service for residents in the Liff Village /Fowlis area.</p>
4	<p>Consequences if contract is not awarded under the ‘best value’ regime If an alternative contract were awarded on Mondays to Fridays until 15:30 then this would potentially undermine the commercial service provision.</p> <p>Any alternative service provided would operate at a significantly lower frequency.</p>
5	<p>Financial implications The cost of this contract is £10,000 per annum (£38.76 per day). This is considered to represent good value for money. The service will operate half-hourly to Liff/Fowlis from 05:45 to 15:30 approx Monday to Friday.</p> <p>As a comparison one morning peak only journey operated under contract to the Council between Lunanhead and Forfar costs £76.72 per day on schooldays, while one off-peak shoppers return journey between Forfar and Noranside costs £55.00 per schoolday.</p> <p>The subsidy per passenger for Angus residents from Liff Village and Fowlis using this contract equates to £0.20 and the subsidy per mile (based on the Liff/Fowlis mileage only) is £0.78.</p>
6	<p>Recommendation</p> <p>It is recommended that this contract is awarded to National Express Dundee. The contract will be on 3 months notice of termination.</p>

APPENDIX 2

1	<p>Contract: A272 Route : Kirriemuir – Glen Clova (Mondays to Fridays non-schooldays)</p>
2	<p>Current commercial service provision on corridor None. Schooldays only Service 801 operated under contract to Angus Council.</p>
3	<p>Reason for recommended award of ‘best value’ contract The award of a contract under ‘best value’ provisions meets the following criteria set out in Appendix 11(a) of Angus Council’s Financial Regulations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To procure emergency replacements for withdrawn services until they can go through the tendering process.
4	<p>Consequences if contract is not awarded under the ‘best value’ regime There would be no return journey on non-schooldays for passengers travelling down from Glen Clova to Kirriemuir to shopping, medical appointments etc.</p>
5	<p>Financial implications The cost of this contract is £66.00 per day. This service will only operate for 35 days until the start of the new school term in August. Tenders are currently being sought in conjunction with the home to school transport re-tendering exercise for continuation of the service beyond that date. The results of that re-tendering exercise will be reported to Members at the June Infrastructure Services committee meeting.</p>
6	<p>Recommendation It is recommended that this contract is awarded to Stagecoach Strathtay until 17 August 2009.</p>