This report further considers the options for procurement of additional car parking to alleviate parking pressures in the vicinity of Arbroath Infirmary and seeks the council’s decisions on the progressions of the proposed scheme.

1 RECOMMENDATIONS

1.1 It is recommended that the Council:

i) notes the outcomes of the discussions which have been held to date between NHS Tayside and council staff with regard to the options to alleviate the parking problems near to Arbroath Infirmary;

ii) notes the preferred layout option to provide additional car parking near the main access to the Infirmary on Common Good land adjacent to Rosemount Road for the reasons stated;

iii) notes confirmation of a one-off funding contribution from NHS Tayside towards the cost of constructing the car park;

iv) notes the views of the Arbroath members who attended the consultation meeting on 29 November 2011; and

v) agrees

- that the identified piece of common good land as set out in Option B be used for the purpose of provision of a car park;
- that £27,000 of Arbroath Common Good either revenue (Option 1) or capital (Option 2) funding be made available to support the construction costs of the car park, and
- subject to the above, the annual maintenance and operating costs be met by the council.

2 BACKGROUND

2.1 A meeting was held in August 2009, attended by NHS (Tayside) and council roads division staff to discuss delivery options to increase parking capacity at Arbroath Infirmary.

2.2 Details of the options were reported to the Infrastructure Services Committee on 19 January 2010 (Report No 53/10) with the recommendation that a further report be brought back to committee on the outcome of any decision by NHS (Tayside) to proceed with the option of procuring additional parking within the hospital grounds.

2.3 Angus Community Health Partnership prepared a bid in 2009 for funding from within NHS (Tayside) for additional car parking within the grounds of Arbroath Infirmary. The bid was unsuccessful on that occasion.

2.4 A further report was presented to the Infrastructure Services Committee in April 2011 (Report No 285/11) recommending that the committee agree that detailed dialogue be undertaken with NHS (Tayside) to investigate each of the alternative delivery options to increase parking capacity at Arbroath Infirmary. The delivery options identified at that time were:-
a) car parking provision within the Infirmary grounds:

i) NHS (Tayside) source the entire funding for the project. This option has been investigated and would be subject to delay pending other current pressures on the available NHS (Tayside) budget. The General Manager had indicated that there may be alternative NHS (Tayside) funds which might be accessible for this purpose and was willing to investigate these.

ii) The Arbroath Common Good Fund provides the funding to construct the facility and is then reimbursed by NHS (Tayside). This would effectively be a loan to NHS (Tayside) at an agreed interest rate (to reflect the current Public Works Loan Board interest rate) over an agreed period.

b) car parking provision on Common Good land (adjacent to Rosemount Road):

i) The Arbroath Common Good Fund provides the resources to allow construction of the car park and then enters into an agreement to lease the car park to NHS (Tayside).

ii) The Common Good Fund procures the construction of the car park with an agreed financial contribution from NHS (Tayside) and the car park is retained as a Common Good asset.

3 CURRENT POSITION

3.1 A meeting was held in July 2011 attended by Angus Council roads division and NHS (Tayside) staff to further investigate the possible car park layout options and to discuss NHS (Tayside) creating a Green Travel Plan for the hospital. NHS (Tayside) is now preparing a Green Travel Plan which may be modified as and when the services delivered at Arbroath Infirmary change.

3.2 During these discussions NHS (Tayside) staff indicated that utilising the only available area of ground within the hospital site for a car park would consequently leave NHS (Tayside) with no scope to extend existing services should the requirement arise in the future. Further the piece of ground available currently proves useful to NHS (Tayside) for occasional needs such as providing compound space for contractors working on the campus.

3.3 The issue of providing safe pedestrian routes within the hospital grounds was also raised as many of the services are dispersed throughout the Infirmary site where patients, staff and visitors walk between departments. The location of the proposed car park site would result in further pedestrian movement along internal service delivery routes without dedicated pedestrian facilities resulting in the risk of pedestrian/vehicle conflict. It is also evident that the number of car parking spaces which can be accommodated within the hospital campus is less than that required to accommodate the current parking demands.

3.4 Accordingly provision of additional parking within the Infirmary grounds is not preferred by the NHS (Tayside). It was agreed that further investigation should be carried out on the provision of external parking facilities on the Arbroath Common Good land on the opposite side of Rosemount Road, adjacent to the railway cutting, giving consideration to the location of accesses and also that part of Rosemount Road is contained within a conservation area.

3.5 The on-site parking use during peak patient activity times by Social Care officers remains ongoing. Although the vehicles are deployed at various locations depending on the activity of the personnel, staff currently return to the Infirmary at various times to access their facilities there due to their shift patterns. It is likely that the council’s on-going review of accommodation needs particularly in Arbroath may in due course relieve this specific pressure on the availability of parking in the vicinity of the Infirmary.

3.6 A further meeting took place in August 2011 between council staff and NHS (Tayside) to consider any further car park layout options on the Common Good land opposite the Infirmary
3.7 The Angus Community Health Partnership Manager has now advised that following consideration of a report on this topic considered by the NHS (Tayside) Board, NHS (Tayside) is prepared to contribute a one-off sum of £60,000 to the provision of car parking based on the preferred option described in this report on Common Good land adjacent to Rosemount Road (Revision B paragraph 4.2 below).

4 OPTIONS

4.1 As outlined above, the proposal to construct the car park within the infirmary grounds, at an estimated cost of £44,000, has been discounted due to health and safety concerns and the potential impact on the ability of NHS (Tayside) to expand its services at the Infirmary as well as for capacity and operational reasons. This in effect discounts options a) (i) and (ii) detailed at 2.4 above.

The focus has therefore been on options b (i) and (ii) both of which require the use of Common Good land adjacent to the Infirmary (Rosemount Road). Either of these options would have planning implications in a number of respects, such as the number of trees requiring to be removed and the fact that the proposed site borders onto a conservation area.

4.2 Following on from consideration of the initial proposed layout, three further layouts have been drawn up for the car park on the Common Good land following suggestions from the August 2011 meeting. Drawings of the alternative layouts are provided in the appendices to this report. These alternative layouts include:

- Revision A indicates a slight deviation from the original layout with the addition of one more disabled bay. (See Appendix 1).
- Revision B shows two disabled bays, with the car park access relocated westwards and closer to the hospital entrance. (See Appendix 2).
- Revision C shows a single line of angled parking with a defined entrance and exit. (See Appendix 3).

An on-street angled parking option was also considered but was discounted on the grounds of road safety and the resultant significant tree removal along the length of Rosemount Road opposite the Infirmary site. Consequently, no detailed costing of this option was undertaken.

The estimated costs of each of the deliverable options are set out below:

i) A detailed estimate for the originally proposed car park layout (975m²) on Common Good ground is £84,000 which includes for lighting, landscaping and tree removal. Revision A (Appendix 1) would also cost £84,000.

ii) A detailed estimate for the car park layout on Common Good ground Revision B (Appendix 2) (1020m²) is £87,000 which includes for lighting, landscaping and tree removal.

iii) A detailed estimate for the car park layout on Common Good ground Revision C (Appendix 3) (1550m²) is £126,000 which includes for lighting, landscaping and tree removal.

The preferred layout from a Roads perspective is Revision B (See Appendix 2) as this option is the best in terms of road traffic movement on Rosemount Road, limits the impact on the established tree line and reduces the visual impact from the residential properties on Rosemount Road at its eastern end and on Alexandra Place.

4.3 The Planning Division would require to be consulted formally for a decision on Angus Council’s Local Plan - Open Space Protection policy. It is intended that discussions with planning colleagues concerning the loss of open space will continue and they will ascertain whether the proposed car park meets the criteria stated in the policy. This may require an ‘Open Space’ audit to be carried out in the surrounding area. The car park must be deemed
4.4 The delivery options for procurement of parking facilities on Common Good land, as identified in paragraph 2.4 b), have been further investigated and further details in this regard are set out below:

4.4.1 Option b (i) – The Arbroath Common Good Fund provides the resources to allow construction of the car park and then enters into an agreement to lease the car park to NHS (Tayside)

NHS (Tayside) have stated that this option is not favoured by them.

4.4.2 Option b (ii) – Common Good procures the car park with an agreed contribution from NHS (Tayside) with the car park retained as a Common Good asset

This option would require agreement to procure the car park construction by utilising a contribution from the Arbroath Common Good Fund of £27,000 (circa 30% of the estimated capital cost) with the balance of £60,000 (circa 70%) being met from a one-off financial contribution from NHS (Tayside). The car park would remain as a Common Good asset.

This option could be enabled through the following agreements:

- The car park would be held as a Common Good Asset;
- The ground remaining with the Common Good or a ground lease for the required area of land (opposite Arbroath Infirmary) between the Arbroath Common Good and the council, who could assume responsibility for maintaining and operating the car park; and
- A one-off financial contribution from both NHS (Tayside) and Arbroath Common Good Fund to enable construction of the car park.

As outlined in paragraph 3.7 above, NHS (Tayside) has confirmed that it is willing to provide a one-off contribution of £60,000 towards the provision of car parking on Common Good land adjacent to Rosemount Road based on revision B. Although this option requires a contribution of circa £27,000 from the Common Good Fund, it would also result in an ongoing additional burden on the Council in terms of operating and maintaining an additional car park if it was leased to the council (possibly Roads Division). Alternatively, responsibility for maintaining the car park could remain with the Arbroath Common Good Fund.

**Funding Option 1 – Common Good Revenue Account**

The immediate impact of funding this option on the Arbroath Common Good Fund revenue account balance is shown in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1 – Summary of Arbroath Common Good Revenue Account (Contribution)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Arbroath Common Good</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projected Balance at 31 March 2012*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estimated Net Deficit for 2012/13 (after allowing for depreciation but before approval of any RB8 budget bids for 2012/13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estimated Fund Balance at 31 March 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Cost @ 30% contribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revised Fund Balance at 31 March 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projected Available Balance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*after allowing for projects approved following the 2011/12 budget setting process and those projects which are currently agreed in principle by the local elected members, but which still require formal committee approval.*
Overall this contribution option would reduce the Arbroath Common Good Fund projected available revenue account balance to £88,677 as at March 2013. This is before any allowance for further bids for funding approved as part of the 2012/13 budget setting process, thereby restricting the funds available for future projects, but may generate additional income from the ground rent.

**Funding Option 2 – Common Good Capital Account**

Table 1 above illustrates that the Arbroath Common Good Fund revenue account is under significant financial pressure and limited resources above the de minimus level of £300,000 are available to fund projects in future. This position may be exacerbated by any essential repair works which require consideration through the 2012/13 budget setting. In light of this position officers have reviewed the potential to fund the £27,000 contribution from the capital account rather than the revenue account. It is recognised that this option was not specifically the subject of consultation with the local elected members but has rather been identified as a further option in light of the depleted revenue account balance.

The proposal is to contribute to the construction of a new car park on common land, which would be held as a Common Good Asset. Having regard to the Common Good Policy it is considered that, in this instance, the Common Good Capital Account may be used. The Common Good Policy states:

> “at the discretion of the Council and with the approval of the Corporate Services Committee any proceeds from the sale of assets may be used to finance capital expenditure on suitable physical assets, should they become available, and which by their purchase would strengthen and maintain the capital account and its on-going value.”

The contribution of £27,000 would result in the creation of a car park with an asset value which would be in excess of the existing land value. This asset would be held as an Arbroath Common Good Asset thus enhancing the asset value of the common good. In addition, the creation of a car park may generate income from the ground lease, which is projected to be greater than the current rental income received from Neighbourhood Services for recreational purposes. On this basis, funding the contribution from the capital account would be permissible under the terms of the existing policy should members wish to pursue this option. The Arbroath Common Good Fund capital account balance as at 31 March 2011 was £747,761, whereof approximately £250,000 is held in cash (invested through the Loans Fund) a proportion of which has arisen through previous asset sales. There is, therefore, capacity within the capital account to meet this £27,000 of expenditure.

4.5 **Revenue Costs**

4.5.1 The cost of the ground lease would require to be assessed by the council’s retained estate agents prior to any lease agreement being concluded. It is anticipated to be in the region of £1,000-£1,500 per annum. Maintenance and operational costs would also arise and would require to be borne by the appropriate parties consistent with the determination by the committee (either the Arbroath Common Good Fund or the council). An estimate has been prepared for the operating, running and maintenance revenue costs for the proposed provision (per Appendix B) based on similarly sized car parks in the management control of the council’s Roads Division.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ground rent</th>
<th>Rates</th>
<th>Annualised maintenance cost including lighting and cleaning costs and structural maintenance</th>
<th>£</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Estimated total annual maintenance and operating cost** £5,500 p.a.
Having regard to the estimated annual maintenance and operating costs and assuming that the Common Good Fund contributes towards the construction of the car park, it would seem reasonable for the Council to assume responsibility for the ongoing running costs in line with the position for other Common Good owned car parks.

4.6 Further Options

4.6.1 The local elected members have been consulted on the broad principle of utilising both Common Good land and Common Good funding to help deliver additional parking. While members are supportive of the need to provide additional car parking there is also recognition of the need to protect the interests of the Common Good. Accordingly the further option set out below has been identified.

4.6.2 Option b (iii) - The Council provides the element of joint funding instead of the Arbroath Common Good Fund, as outlined in Option b (ii).

This option would require a ground lease to be put in place for the required area of land (opposite Arbroath Infirmary) between the Arbroath Common Good and the council, at an estimated cost of £1,000 - £1,500 per annum. The Council would then assume responsibility for maintaining and operating the car park on an ongoing basis. A one-off financial contribution from both NHS (Tayside) and Angus Council would then be required to fund the £87,000 cost of the works. Based on a contribution of £60,000 from NHS (Tayside). A sum of £27,000 would require to be met from resources available within the overall budget in 2012/13 including possible 2011/12 revenue budget 100% carry forward if a net budget underspend is realised.

It should be noted that there is currently no specific provision for funding within the Infrastructure Services Department budget allocations for either the £27,000 contribution to works costs or the annual running costs of £5,500 noted in the table above.

4.7 Subject to the decisions made by the council, a planning application will be lodged in support of the proposal for determination by the Development Standards Committee.

5 Arbroath Member Consultation

5.1 A meeting was called of the Arbroath members to discuss this proposal, and five of the eight members were present. At the meeting those present unanimously supported the following:-

- That the identified piece of common good land as set out in Option B, be used for the purpose of provision of a car park,
- That £27,000 of Arbroath Common Good revenue funding be made available to support the construction costs of the car park, and
- The annual ground rental as set out in the report be accepted as the income from the rental to Arbroath Common Good Fund.

As outlined in paragraph 4.4.2 the option of applying capital account funding to meet the £27,000 was not discussed at the meeting with local members but has arisen subsequently when looking forward to the projected revenue account position at 31 March 2013.

6 RISKS

6.1 The risks associated with the various procurement options have been outlined within section 4 of this report. Subsequent risks associated with the delivery phase will be considered as and when proposals develop to that stage.
7 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

7.1 The preferred option for the delivery of additional car parking provision in the vicinity of Arbroath Infirmary is that shown on the drawing Revision B as detailed in Appendix 2, at an estimated cost of £87,000.

7.2 NHS (Tayside) has confirmed that it is willing to provide a one-off contribution of £60,000 towards the costs of constructing a car park in accordance with the preferred option. Based on this level of contribution a balance of £27,000 remains and three options to deliver the required balance of funding and the associated financial implications have been identified in section 4 above.

7.3 Members are asked to determine the preferred option for the progression of this proposal if any, having regard to the funding available from NHS (Tayside), the funding impact of each of the identified options and the potential impact on the Arbroath Common Good Fund.

7.4 It is proposed that once the Council determines its preference a further report would be required to detail fully the implications both to the NHS (Tayside) and to the various council funds and/or the Arbroath Common Good Fund, as well as the associated delivery implications both in terms of the necessary statutory consents and the procurement arrangements.

8 HUMAN RIGHTS IMPLICATIONS

8.1 There are no human rights implications arising from the proposals in this report.

9 EQUALITIES IMPLICATIONS

9.1 The issues dealt with in this report have been the subject of consideration from an equalities perspective (as required by legislation). An equalities impact assessment is not required.

10 ANGUS COMMUNITY PLAN AND SINGLE OUTCOME AGREEMENT

10.1 This report contributes to the following local outcome contained within the Angus Community Plan and Single Outcome Agreement 2011-2014:

- Communities in Angus are safe, secure and vibrant

11 CONSULTATION

11.1 The Chief Executive, Head of Finance, Head of Law and Administration, Director of Social Work and Health, the Director of Neighbourhood Services and the NHS (Tayside) have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

12 CONCLUSION

12.1 From further investigations and meetings it has been established that the area available within the Arbroath Infirmary grounds has limited parking capacity and possible pedestrian safety implications. Construction of a car park on the Common Good land is the NHS (Tayside) preferred option which could provide sufficient parking capacity to address the parking problems around the Infirmary whilst being in a suitable and convenient location for patient access.

12.2 Funding option b (ii) Utilising Common Good revenue funding is the preferred option.
NOTE:

No background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) were relied on to a material extent in preparing the above report.
Appendix 2

**Available Spaces:** 37
**Disabled Spaces:** 2
**Bay Dimension:** 2.4m x 4.8m
**Aisle Dimension:** 6m Wide

---

**Drawing Date:** 24/2/2011

**Drawing Title:** CAR PARK LINING LAYOUT

**Project No:** PROPOSED HOSPITAL CAR PARK, ARBROATH

---

**Information:** Park & Plane seating

---

**Design No:** HCSP.02

---

**Scale:** 1:1

**Checked by:**

**Approved by:**

---

**Report No:** 836/11

---

**High Gunning**