

Kirriemuir Square Enhancements – Public Realm Refurbishments
Project no. ML/KIRR/01

Consultation Report

Consultation was conducted through a consultation leaflet distributed to Kirriemuir access office & library and through the “Have your say” website. The leaflet included a plan with artist's impressions and a description of the proposed works. A1 sized plans were also displayed in the library where people could view the proposals.

Additionally a pop-up covered stand was erected in The Square on Saturday 10 May between noon and 4pm where the plans were also available for viewing.

The Local Authority has received 122 consultation responses via forms and emails. This is a reasonable body of response and gives a good indication of public opinion.

After analysis of the responses the following results have been found;

From 122 responses it breaks down as follows;

22% of responses were strongly in favour of the proposals
26% of responses were strongly against the proposals
52% of responses were neutral (neither strongly for or against)

Additionally comments have been received and accumulated for various aspects of the proposals:

1% of responses were in favour of the placement of Bon Scott statue in the square
78% of responses were against the placement of Bon Scott statue in the square
21% of responses were neutral on the placement of Bon Scott statue in the square

14% were in favour of the use of stainless steel
21% were against the use of stainless steel
65% were neutral to the use of stainless steel

7% suggested black metal instead of stainless steel

22% were in favour of the proposed style seating
20% were against the proposed style seating
58% were neutral to the proposed style seating

20% were in favour of the proposed timeline
14% were against the proposed timeline
66% were neutral to the proposed timeline

3% suggested a notice board in the square

3% were in favour of a proposed bus shelter in the square
11% were against a proposed bus shelter in the square
86% were neutral to a proposed bus shelter in the square.

2% were in favour of permanent perennial planting
1% were against permanent perennial planting
97% were neutral to permanent perennial planting

2% suggested flower tubs

8% were in favour of proposed paving material colours
8% were against the proposed paving material colours
84% were neutral to the proposed paving material colours

Analysis of the results

Of the 122 respondents who commented on the proposed Kirriemuir Square Enhancement proposals, 22% broadly agreed with the proposals and 26% did not; the remaining 52% had particular concern regarding a particular aspect of the design, for example Bon Scott statue or having a bus shelter in the square, but no view was expressed on the proposals as a whole.

Therefore it can be concluded that 74% of all consultees were either supportive or neutral towards the design proposals and only 26% were against the scheme, which is not considered to be a fundamental objection to the proposals.

However, some of the individual points that respondents cited as reasoning behind their objections can be addressed. These points are detailed below in order of the level of opinions expressed.

'Bon' Scott Statue

In regards to a possible location of the proposed Bon Scott statue in the Square, from those that commented there was a clear majority opinion of 78% against the statue being located in the Square. Only one respondent (1%) voted in favour of the statue being in the Square & 21% did not mention the statue in their responses.

Comments expressed include, ' Support erection of Bon Scott statue, but not in the square', 'Do not allow statue of Bon Scott in Square, no role model and no space in Square for two statues'

From these consultation responses there is an obvious consensus of dislike to locating the Bon Scott statue in the Square. In addition to the negative response it is also worth noting that if the statue goes ahead it is likely to require the re-location of the Christmas tree into the centre of the Square.

It is therefore suggested that Council officers attempt to make contact with DD8 Music group to gauge their thoughts in light of the consultation results and their current funding situation. The Steering Group will need to make a decision on whether the Bon Scott statue should be

accommodated in the Square. If the statue does not go ahead it is suggested that a new feature will be designed in its location.

Stainless Steel and the use of Black Metal

21% of respondents were strongly opposed to the use or over use of stainless steel with 14% in favour. 65% of respondents gave no mention of stainless steel. 7% of respondents, who were opposed to stainless steel suggested the use of black painted metal instead. Some respondents have mentioned there is an attempt to have a black metal theme throughout the town centre, which should be continued at the Square.

There is not an overwhelming objection to the use of stainless steel. However, it is felt there is significant enough opposition to warrant a reduction in the amount of stainless steel.

It is therefore recommended that street furniture with larger expanses of stainless steel should be replaced with black painted mild steel, such as bins, bollards and the bespoke tree guard. However, the design team still feels that the design should still be of a contemporary nature.

Where the stainless steel is of small visual impact and helps to minimise future maintenance implications the use of stainless steel should be retained, as in the proposed seating and cycle stands.

Comments expressed include, *'Stainless steel is garish, suggest cast iron/wood would be much more aesthetically pleasing'* *'Reduce amount of stainless steel'*.

Comments expressed include, *'Materials should be black metal and timber to be consistent throughout town centre'* *'No stainless steel, suggest wrought iron'*

Seating

22% were in favour of the proposed style seating and 20% were against the suggested design. 58% did not mention the seating at all.

As there was a slight majority in favour of the proposed seats it is recommended to proceed with the proposed design in predominantly hardwood timber with minimal stainless steel.

Comments expressed include, *'would very much enjoy the new seating'* *'Plan for central tree & curved benches between Peter Pan & museum at town house looks good'* *'Seating blocks access to shops'* *'Existing benches more in keeping with town than more modern benches'* *'Proposes two additional benches to look in other directions. Would like armrests'*

Some concerns that were expressed on the orientation and location of the seats had already been picked up in the design. Some respondents expressed concern on the perceived smaller space available for events but in fact two of the seats are in the same locations as the existing benches and instead of the third seat in the centre of the Square there is now an additional seat in front of the tree, effectively freeing up extra space in the centre of the Square. Other than the possible inclusion of a Bon Scott statue the new design proposals are not reducing space.

Some respondents expressed concern that all the benches were facing the same way and

requested some to face south and north. However, with the proposed seats being curved they allow the user to orientate their view depending on where they sit on the bench. Also, it is possible to further adjust the location of the bench along the arc (timeline) making the orientation more northerly or southerly. It is worth noting that the radius of the bench is more curved than it appears on the plan.

'Why are all benches facing Visocchis?' 'Seating blocks access to shops' 'Propose tree seat around tree, put 2 benches around peter pan statue'

Timeline

20% of respondents were in favour of the proposed timeline, 14% were against and 66% of respondents did not mention the timeline.

There appeared to be some confusion as to what the timeline was representing, running from the Peter Pan statue to the proposed location of the Bon Scott Statue. It should probably be clarified that the line of contrasting paving stones will highlight some aspects of Kirriemuir's cultural history in stone carved panels rather than providing a comprehensive illustration of the town's history. As the intention is to develop the design of this band of paving by working with local schools and community groups a more detailed description is not yet available.

This line also intends to connect the various items of street furniture and create movement in the paving design and finally attempts to connect the two statues.

At 14% objection, this is not a fundamental objection and the result for those in favour was higher at 20%. Therefore, we recommend keeping the proposed timeline with illustrative granite insets as proposed.

Comments expressed include, *'Good to include history of town leading to museum'*

Proposed Bus Shelter in the Square

3% were in favour of the proposed bus shelter being in the Square, i.e. at the existing bus stop. 11% were against a bus shelter in the Square and 86% of respondents did not mention the bus shelter as an issue.

Comments expressed include, *'Move bus shelter further into Bank street away from square' 'Bus shelter will interfere with photo of peter pan'*

5% of respondents did not like the look of the proposed bus shelter, citing that it was too modern looking or wrong design.

Comments expressed include, *'a modern metal bus shelter would not fit in and metal seat is not useful in cold weather' & 'the bus shelter must have timber & black metal work in the same design reference'. 'Dislike bus shelter design; prefer Victoriana/arts & crafts design.'*

Whilst 11% objection to the bus shelter being in the Square is not a consensus, there was little support for it at 3%.

It is therefore recommended that consideration be given to the installation of the bus shelter

further down Bank Street away from the Square. This location would allow a fully enclosed shelter to be provided and interference with the Peter Pan statue would not be an issue. It must be noted though that this would mean the loss of one or possibly two parking spaces and additional costs that could not be absorbed within the current project costs. This proposal requires further review and research and needs to be reported back to the Steering Group at a later date.

Paving Material Colours

8% of respondents were in favour of the scheme as a whole and did not highlight any problems with proposed paving material colours. 8% were against the colours proposed. 84% did not mention the colours of paving in their comments.

Therefore 92% of respondents were either not concerned about it or were in favour.

Comments expressed include, *'Black granite not in keeping, suggest rose coloured granite.'*
'Suggest more natural with pink/red stonework maybe' *'Good decorative paving will help area'*

The design team proposed the use of white and black granite in order to achieve a contrast to existing paving so they could be seen clearly. However, the possibility of selecting a stone with more pink/red hue can be considered.

Other comments

A small number of respondents commented on a range of issues:

Five people voiced an objection to permanent planting replacing bedding flowers around the Peter Pan statue.

'Peter Pan & floral display most important.'

If desired the existing bedding planting could be retained at the Peter Pan statue as part of the ongoing flower display along Bellies Brae.

A number of respondents asked where the Christmas Tree would be located. It is envisaged that if the plans for the Bon Scott statue do not go ahead then the Tree would remain in its current location. If the statue is erected as shown on the drawings it is likely that the Christmas Tree would need to be moved to the centre of the Square.

A couple of respondents specifically requested flower tubs in the square.

'Would like to see flower tubs 3 or 4 in square.'

The design team understands that there is a community group evolving who aim to provide planters in the Square, which dependent on their size can be accommodated in the design.

A small number suggested improved lighting, such as new uplighters to Peter Pan statue and the town house. Due to the high maintenance costs of further lighting it is recommended to retain the existing lighting scheme at the statue.

'Recommend lighting to peter pan statue upgraded & new uplighters at museum.'

A few people suggested having a new notice board in the square to advertise events.

'Would like information board like one outside park in Blairgowrie.'

'Would like notice board for coming events.'

The need for an information board has not been expressed before but if required would possibly be better at a different location to reduce the amount of furniture in the Square.